

January 7, 2011

Investment Grade Credit

## European Banks EC – More Clarity on Resolution

**Regulators picking up the pace on resolution.** As expected, the EC issued its working paper on bank recovery and resolution which will form the basis for its draft legislative proposals that will be tabled in June 2011.

**Content largely consistent with previous releases** but more details were provided on the key elements of supervision, prevention, recovery planning, early intervention and resolution. See [Bank Resolution Regimes - 2011 Driver](#), November 24, 2010, for the basics of the new proposals.

**Wide ranging resolution tools** including selling a business, transfer to a bridge bank, asset separation or **as a last resort the debt conversion/write-down tool**. The bottom line is that banks will be allowed to fail and regulators will have the toolkit to ensure that creditors (including seniors) will take losses in the future.

**Write down of debt going forward.** While debt write-down is 'not envisaged' to apply to debt currently in issue, we see this as a cold comfort for the markets as in many ways this largely mimics the approach of the SDRM (Sovereign Debt Recovery Mechanism) that will also only apply in the future (from 2013), but which was taken badly by the sovereign debt markets.

**Peripheral concerns will be the biggest driver as we look into 2011** and will override Basel technicals, as we've stated for some weeks now. Regulatory change on bank resolution is further negative news for the sector, supporting our current underweight recommendation (see [Reversal of Fortune - European Banks in 2011](#), November 30, 2010, and [Position for a Volatile 2011](#), January 6, 2011).

**Bank seniors safe in the short term** and the defensive trade amid peripheral concerns. We expect continued decompression of spreads at weaker banks as sub debt is increasingly at risk of taking losses. However, medium term, we expect a compression of senior/sub in stronger names as high quality seniors are not priced for regulatory change on bank resolution.

### MORGAN STANLEY RESEARCH

Morgan Stanley & Co.  
International plc+

**Lee Street**

Lee.Street@morganstanley.com  
+44 (20) 7677 0406

**Jackie Ineke**

Jackie.ineke@morganstanley.com  
+41 (44) 220 9246

**Fiona Simpson**

Fiona.Simpson@morganstanley.com  
+44 (20) 7677 3745

**Natacha Blackman**

Natacha.Blackman@morganstanley.com  
+44 (20) 7425 7967

*Due to the nature of the fixed income market, the issuers or bonds of the issuers recommended or discussed in this report may not be continuously followed. Accordingly, investors must regard this report as providing stand-alone analysis and should not expect continuing analysis or additional reports relating to such issuers or bonds of the issuers.*

Morgan Stanley does and seeks to do business with companies covered in Morgan Stanley Research. As a result, investors should be aware that the firm may have a conflict of interest that could affect the objectivity of Morgan Stanley Research. Investors should consider Morgan Stanley Research as only a single factor in making their investment decision.

**For analyst certification and other important disclosures, refer to the Disclosure Section, located at the end of this report.**

+ = Analysts employed by non-U.S. affiliates are not registered with FINRA, may not be associated persons of the member and may not be subject to NASD/NYSE restrictions on communications with a subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by a research analyst account.

January 7, 2011  
European Banks  
EC – More Clarity on Resolution

## European Banks

### EC – More Clarity on Resolution

#### EC Framework for Bank Recovery and Resolution

As expected the EC issued its working document entitled 'Technical Details of a Possible EU Framework for Bank Recovery and Resolution'. In conjunction with an impact assessment, this will likely form the basis for the EC legislative proposals that are expected to be tabled in June 2011; however, the details are subject to change. The content of the release was largely in line with what had previously been announced and fleshes out the EC paper on crisis management from October 20, 2010 (see again *Bank Resolution Regimes – 2011 Driver* for more details). The legislative proposals will lead to an EC Directive, but we find it unlikely that will become law before mid-2012 at the earliest.

#### Resolution Tools

The document is split into several parts dealing with scope of application, supervision, prevention, early intervention and resolution. While the whole document is of interest, we focus our attention on the section dealing with resolution. **The core underlying principle is clear, banks should be allowed to fail and shareholders and unsecured creditors should take losses going forward** while insured depositors and taxpayers are protected. The objectives do also specifically reference maintaining financial stability and preventing contagion. In terms of resolution tools, the document proposes a variety of solutions. These are as follows:

##### Sale of Business Tool

This would enable resolution authorities to effect a sale of a credit institution in whole or in part without requiring the consent of shareholders or complying with normal procedural requirements.

##### Bridge Bank Tool

This would enable resolution authorities to transfer all or part of the credit institution to a bridge bank. This would be a publicly owned institution and the ultimate objective would be to facilitate the sale of the bridge bank. The operations of the bridge bank should be temporary and should be terminated within one year, although this may be extended by up to one year. Note that if the bank has not been sold before the maximum period has expired, then it should be wound up.

#### Asset Separation Tool

This is effectively a good bank/bad bank split.

#### Debt Write-Down Tool

This is a mechanism that would permit resolution authorities to write down or convert into equity unsecured creditors of a failing institution. Note that it is not envisaged that this will apply to debt currently in issue. This is only designed to be used as a last resort and aimed at large, complex institutions that are deemed too big to fail. We go into this option in more detail below.

Page 10 of the document gives a useful pictorial representation of the order in which resolution tools should be applied to failing institutions. The first option should always be an ordinary liquidation, if this is not possible, then a bank should be wound down in an orderly manner; this may include the selling of the business, the creation of a bridge bank or the creation of a good bank/bad bank. Only if this is not possible should a bank be restructured as a going concern which may require the use of the debt write-down tool. We would reiterate that this tool is to be only used as a last resort and note that in all of the options described above, we believe that existing creditors could lose money.

#### The Debt Write-Down Tool: Not Envisaged to Apply to Existing Debt

There is a separate annex on debt write-down as an additional resolution tool. The paper is clear that it relates to possible future legislative changes which would be subject to full assessment and appropriate transition provisions and periods to avoid market instability or unintended consequences. It notes that it is not envisaged to apply measures adopted to debt currently in issue. We take a negative view of the proposal as we explain in more detail below and believe that the EC could have used stronger language in support of existing creditors than simply 'not envisaging' that this will impact them. We certainly do not take this as a guarantee that existing creditors will be protected going forward. The document acknowledges ongoing work on contingent capital by regulators and notes that debt write-down/bail-in debt and contingent capital can be complimentary.

January 7, 2011  
 European Banks  
 EC – More Clarity on Resolution

**The paper notes that regulators should get a statutory power to write off all equity and either write off subordinated debt or convert it into equity.** However, citing the example of RBS in 2008, it notes that this may not always be enough and seeks to give regulators additional powers to make a broad range of senior creditors “face the real risk associated with bank failure”. The document describes two possible approaches as to how a debt write-down tool might be implemented.

### 1. Comprehensive Approach

This would be a statutory power to write down by a discretionary amount or convert all debt into equity to return a bank to solvency. This would only apply to new issued debt but would include senior debt and notes that this feature should be contractually recognised within the bond documentation in the future. It does note that certain exclusions might be necessary, this may include: swap, repo and derivatives counterparties and other trade creditors; short-term debt (defined by a specified maximum maturity); retail and wholesale deposits and secured debt (including covered bonds). Without dwelling on the matter, we note that there could be multiple technical problems with this, e.g., how tapped bonds would be treated, encouraging banks to fund themselves with short maturities to avoid having to issue debt with write-down language, the risk of subverting the normal ranking of bank bonds etc.

### 2. A Targeted Approach

This approach would require institutions to have a fixed volume of a bail-in debt in issue which could be written down or converted via a statutory trigger. This would need to include a contractual term that would specify that the relevant resolution authority could use a statutory power to write down debt when an institution meets the trigger conditions for entry into resolution. This could include a fixed minimum for all institutions, e.g., as a percentage of total liabilities.

The document is not drawn on what should be the trigger for write-down but acknowledges that holders would want the trigger to be as transparent, objective and predictable as possible. Further, the document also notes that a bank might have difficulty in getting liquidity after it has been through a resolution procedure and hence to increase the availability of funding to a bank immediately post resolution, the EC raises the idea of new funding being ‘super senior’ on a temporary or permanent basis.

Following the discussion of resolution tools, there is a section on resolution powers on page 56 in the document. In this section, it details a list of powers that the resolution authorities

should have in place to be able to apply their resolution tools. It specifically notes that the resolution authority should have the power to write off claims of unsecured creditors of an affected institution and the power to convert debt instruments into shares. This makes sense in relation to the debt write-down tool. However, there is an ambiguous footnote that notes that these powers should be available in connection with any of the resolution tools. We presume that this only relates to new issued instruments as described above, but it is unclear.

Overall, the EC is attempting to draw a line in the sand between current outstanding instruments and new instruments that may be able to be written down. Although we find that the language that it uses is relatively weak in support of existing instruments with the EC simply “not envisaging” that these powers will be used on debt currently in issue. We believe that this is reminiscent of the SDRM (Sovereign Debt Recovery Mechanism) put forward by Germany to include collective action clauses from 2013 that had a significant impact on the sovereign debt markets. **Ultimately, the EC is creating a framework to permit banks to be resolved/liquidated/wound up and making it easier to enforce losses on unsecured creditors (both senior and subordinated) in the event that an institution fails). As a result, bank creditors will no longer be able to get a free ride as they did in 2008 and 2009 again.**

Despite comments on write-downs only applying to new issue debt, there can be no guarantees that this would be the case if an institution were to fail; for example, we are seeing new precedents being set with new Irish laws. Ultimately, actions of governments in the UK, Ireland and Germany have already shown that rules can be changed swiftly if need be in any case. In our view, what this paper shows (and showed last October) is that any investor still under the impression that debt is somehow safe, should think again.

Further, the idea of creating ‘super senior funding’ could further subordinate creditors even if they do survive a restructuring. When this is coupled with the possibility of making depositors rank senior to senior unsecured debt (this was previously raised by the EC in its October 2010 paper), this is generically negative for bank credit. **Taken together with our concerns linked to peripheral Europe, this supports our view of staying close to home in 2011, focusing on the most defensive names and our underweight stance on Tier 1 (see again *Position for a Volatile 2011, January 6, 2011, for detailed recommendations*).**

January 7, 2011  
 European Banks  
 EC – More Clarity on Resolution

## Disclosure Section

Morgan Stanley & Co. International plc, authorized and regulated by Financial Services Authority, disseminates in the UK research that it has prepared, and approves solely for the purposes of section 21 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000, research which has been prepared by any of its affiliates. As used in this disclosure section, Morgan Stanley includes RMB Morgan Stanley (Proprietary) Limited, Morgan Stanley & Co International plc and its affiliates.

For important disclosures, stock price charts and equity rating histories regarding companies that are the subject of this report, please see the Morgan Stanley Research Disclosure Website at [www.morganstanley.com/researchdisclosures](http://www.morganstanley.com/researchdisclosures), or contact your investment representative or Morgan Stanley Research at 1585 Broadway, (Attention: Research Management), New York, NY, 10036 USA.

### Analyst Certification

The following analysts hereby certify that their views about the companies and their securities discussed in this report are accurately expressed and that they have not received and will not receive direct or indirect compensation in exchange for expressing specific recommendations or views in this report: Lee Street.

Unless otherwise stated, the individuals listed on the cover page of this report are research analysts.

### Global Research Conflict Management Policy

Morgan Stanley Research has been published in accordance with our conflict management policy, which is available at [www.morganstanley.com/institutional/research/conflictolicies](http://www.morganstanley.com/institutional/research/conflictolicies).

### Important US Regulatory Disclosures on Subject Companies

The equity research analysts or strategists principally responsible for the preparation of Morgan Stanley Research have received compensation based upon various factors, including quality of research, investor client feedback, stock picking, competitive factors, firm revenues and overall investment banking revenues.

Morgan Stanley and its affiliates do business that relates to companies/instruments covered in Morgan Stanley Research, including market making, providing liquidity and specialized trading, risk arbitrage and other proprietary trading, fund management, commercial banking, extension of credit, investment services and investment banking. Morgan Stanley sells to and buys from customers the securities/instruments of companies covered in Morgan Stanley Research on a principal basis. Morgan Stanley may have a position in the debt of the Company or instruments discussed in this report.

Certain disclosures listed above are also for compliance with applicable regulations in non-US jurisdictions.

### STOCK RATINGS

Morgan Stanley uses a relative rating system using terms such as Overweight, Equal-weight, Not-Rated or Underweight (see definitions below). Morgan Stanley does not assign ratings of Buy, Hold or Sell to the stocks we cover. Overweight, Equal-weight, Not-Rated and Underweight are not the equivalent of buy, hold and sell. Investors should carefully read the definitions of all ratings used in Morgan Stanley Research. In addition, since Morgan Stanley Research contains more complete information concerning the analyst's views, investors should carefully read Morgan Stanley Research, in its entirety, and not infer the contents from the rating alone. In any case, ratings (or research) should not be used or relied upon as investment advice. An investor's decision to buy or sell a stock should depend on individual circumstances (such as the investor's existing holdings) and other considerations.

### Global Stock Ratings Distribution

(as of December 31, 2010)

For disclosure purposes only (in accordance with NASD and NYSE requirements), we include the category headings of Buy, Hold, and Sell alongside our ratings of Overweight, Equal-weight, Not-Rated and Underweight. Morgan Stanley does not assign ratings of Buy, Hold or Sell to the stocks we cover. Overweight, Equal-weight, Not-Rated and Underweight are not the equivalent of buy, hold, and sell but represent recommended relative weightings (see definitions below). To satisfy regulatory requirements, we correspond Overweight, our most positive stock rating, with a buy recommendation; we correspond Equal-weight and Not-Rated to hold and Underweight to sell recommendations, respectively.

Stock Rating Category	Coverage Universe		Investment Banking Clients (IBC)		
	Count	% of Total	Count	Total IBC	% of % of Rating Category
<b>Overweight/Buy</b>	<b>1145</b>	<b>40%</b>	<b>437</b>	<b>44%</b>	<b>38%</b>
<b>Equal-weight/Hold</b>	<b>1192</b>	<b>42%</b>	<b>422</b>	<b>42%</b>	<b>35%</b>
<b>Not-Rated/Hold</b>	<b>119</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>21%</b>
<b>Underweight/Sell</b>	<b>382</b>	<b>13%</b>	<b>109</b>	<b>11%</b>	<b>29%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,838</b>		<b>993</b>		

Data include common stock and ADRs currently assigned ratings. An investor's decision to buy or sell a stock should depend on individual circumstances (such as the investor's existing holdings) and other considerations. Investment Banking Clients are companies from whom Morgan Stanley received investment banking compensation in the last 12 months.

### Analyst Stock Ratings

Overweight (O). The stock's total return is expected to exceed the average total return of the analyst's industry (or industry team's) coverage universe, on a risk-adjusted basis, over the next 12-18 months.

Equal-weight (E). The stock's total return is expected to be in line with the average total return of the analyst's industry (or industry team's) coverage universe, on a risk-adjusted basis, over the next 12-18 months.

Not-Rated (NR). Currently the analyst does not have adequate conviction about the stock's total return relative to the average total return of the analyst's industry (or industry team's) coverage universe, on a risk-adjusted basis, over the next 12-18 months.

Underweight (U). The stock's total return is expected to be below the average total return of the analyst's industry (or industry team's) coverage universe, on a risk-adjusted basis, over the next 12-18 months.

Unless otherwise specified, the time frame for price targets included in Morgan Stanley Research is 12 to 18 months.

### Analyst Industry Views

Attractive (A): The analyst expects the performance of his or her industry coverage universe over the next 12-18 months to be attractive vs. the relevant broad market benchmark, as indicated below.

January 7, 2011  
 European Banks  
 EC – More Clarity on Resolution

In-Line (I): The analyst expects the performance of his or her industry coverage universe over the next 12-18 months to be in line with the relevant broad market benchmark, as indicated below.

Cautious (C): The analyst views the performance of his or her industry coverage universe over the next 12-18 months with caution vs. the relevant broad market benchmark, as indicated below.

Benchmarks for each region are as follows: North America - S&P 500; Latin America - relevant MSCI country index or MSCI Latin America Index; Europe - MSCI Europe; Japan - TOPIX; Asia - relevant MSCI country index.

## Important Disclosures for Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC Customers

Citi Investment Research & Analysis (CIRA) research reports may be available about the companies or topics that are the subject of Morgan Stanley Research. Ask your Financial Advisor or use Research Center to view any available CIRA research reports in addition to Morgan Stanley research reports.

Important disclosures regarding the relationship between the companies that are the subject of Morgan Stanley Research and Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC, Morgan Stanley and Citigroup Global Markets Inc. or any of their affiliates, are available on the Morgan Stanley Smith Barney disclosure website at [www.morganstanleysmithbarney.com/researchdisclosures](http://www.morganstanleysmithbarney.com/researchdisclosures).

For Morgan Stanley and Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. specific disclosures, you may refer to [www.morganstanley.com/researchdisclosures](http://www.morganstanley.com/researchdisclosures) and [https://www.citigroupgeo.com/geopublic/Disclosures/index\\_a.html](https://www.citigroupgeo.com/geopublic/Disclosures/index_a.html).

Each Morgan Stanley Equity Research report is reviewed and approved on behalf of Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC. This review and approval is conducted by the same person who reviews the Equity Research report on behalf of Morgan Stanley. This could create a conflict of interest.

## Other Important Disclosures

Morgan Stanley produces an equity research product called a "Tactical Idea." Views contained in a "Tactical Idea" on a particular stock may be contrary to the recommendations or views expressed in research on the same stock. This may be the result of differing time horizons, methodologies, market events, or other factors. For all research available on a particular stock, please contact your sales representative or go to Client Link at [www.morganstanley.com](http://www.morganstanley.com).

Morgan Stanley Research does not provide individually tailored investment advice. Morgan Stanley Research has been prepared without regard to the individual financial circumstances and objectives of persons who receive it. Morgan Stanley recommends that investors independently evaluate particular investments and strategies, and encourages investors to seek the advice of a financial adviser. The appropriateness of a particular investment or strategy will depend on an investor's individual circumstances and objectives. The securities, instruments, or strategies discussed in Morgan Stanley Research may not be suitable for all investors, and certain investors may not be eligible to purchase or participate in some or all of them.

The fixed income research analysts or strategists principally responsible for the preparation of Morgan Stanley Research have received compensation based upon various factors, including quality, accuracy and value of research, firm profitability or revenues (which include fixed income trading and capital markets profitability or revenues), client feedback and competitive factors. Fixed Income Research analysts' or strategists' compensation is not linked to investment banking or capital markets transactions performed by Morgan Stanley or the profitability or revenues of particular trading desks.

Morgan Stanley Research is not an offer to buy or sell or the solicitation of an offer to buy or sell any security/instrument or to participate in any particular trading strategy. The "Important US Regulatory Disclosures on Subject Companies" section in Morgan Stanley Research lists all companies mentioned where Morgan Stanley owns 1% or more of a class of common equity securities of the companies. For all other companies mentioned in Morgan Stanley Research, Morgan Stanley may have an investment of less than 1% in securities/instruments or derivatives of securities/instruments of companies and may trade them in ways different from those discussed in Morgan Stanley Research. Employees of Morgan Stanley not involved in the preparation of Morgan Stanley Research may have investments in securities/instruments or derivatives of securities/instruments of companies mentioned and may trade them in ways different from those discussed in Morgan Stanley Research. Derivatives may be issued by Morgan Stanley or associated persons.

With the exception of information regarding Morgan Stanley, Morgan Stanley Research is based on public information. Morgan Stanley makes every effort to use reliable, comprehensive information, but we make no representation that it is accurate or complete. We have no obligation to tell you when opinions or information in Morgan Stanley Research change apart from when we intend to discontinue equity research coverage of a subject company. Facts and views presented in Morgan Stanley Research have not been reviewed by, and may not reflect information known to, professionals in other Morgan Stanley business areas, including investment banking personnel.

Morgan Stanley Research personnel may participate in company events such as site visits and are generally prohibited from accepting payment by the company of associated expenses unless pre-approved by authorized members of Research management.

The value of and income from your investments may vary because of changes in interest rates, foreign exchange rates, default rates, prepayment rates, securities/instruments prices, market indexes, operational or financial conditions of companies or other factors. There may be time limitations on the exercise of options or other rights in securities/instruments transactions. Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. Estimates of future performance are based on assumptions that may not be realized. If provided, and unless otherwise stated, the closing price on the cover page is that of the primary exchange for the subject company's securities/instruments.

Morgan Stanley may make investment decisions or take proprietary positions that are inconsistent with the recommendations or views in this report.

To our readers in Taiwan: Information on securities/instruments that trade in Taiwan is distributed by Morgan Stanley Taiwan Limited ("MSTL"). Such information is for your reference only. Information on any securities/instruments issued by a company owned by the government of or incorporated in the PRC and listed in the Stock Exchange of Hong Kong ("SEHK"), namely the H-shares, including the component company stocks of the Stock Exchange of Hong Kong ("SEHK")'s Hang Seng China Enterprise Index; or any securities/instruments issued by a company that is 30% or more directly- or indirectly-owned by the government of or a company incorporated in the PRC and traded on an exchange in Hong Kong or Macau, namely SEHK's Red Chip shares, including the component company of the SEHK's China-affiliated Corp Index is distributed only to Taiwan Securities Investment Trust Enterprises ("SITE"). The reader should independently evaluate the investment risks and is solely responsible for their investment decisions. Morgan Stanley Research may not be distributed to the public media or quoted or used by the public media without the express written consent of Morgan Stanley. Information on securities/instruments that do not trade in Taiwan is for informational purposes only and is not to be construed as a recommendation or a solicitation to trade in such securities/instruments. MSTL may not execute transactions for clients in these securities/instruments.

To our readers in Hong Kong: Information is distributed in Hong Kong by and on behalf of, and is attributable to, Morgan Stanley Asia Limited as part of its regulated activities in Hong Kong. If you have any queries concerning Morgan Stanley Research, please contact our Hong Kong sales representatives.

Morgan Stanley Research is disseminated in Japan by Morgan Stanley MUFG Securities, Co., Ltd.; in Hong Kong by Morgan Stanley Asia Limited (which accepts responsibility for its contents); in Singapore by Morgan Stanley Asia (Singapore) Pte. (Registration number 199206298Z) and/or Morgan Stanley Asia (Singapore) Securities Pte Ltd (Registration number 200008434H), regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore, which accepts responsibility for its contents; in Australia to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of the Australian Corporations Act by Morgan Stanley Australia Limited A.B.N. 67 003 734 576, holder of Australian financial services license No. 233742, which accepts responsibility for its contents; in Australia to "wholesale clients" and "retail clients" within the meaning of the Australian Corporations Act by Morgan Stanley Smith Barney Australia Pty Ltd (A.B.N. 19 009 145 555, holder of Australian financial services license No. 240813, which accepts responsibility for its contents; in Korea by Morgan Stanley & Co International plc, Seoul Branch; in India by Morgan Stanley India Company Private Limited; in Canada by Morgan Stanley Canada Limited, which has approved of, and has agreed to take responsibility for, the contents of Morgan Stanley Research in Canada; in Germany by Morgan Stanley Bank AG, Frankfurt am Main and Morgan Stanley Private Wealth Management Limited, Niederlassung Deutschland, regulated by Bundesanstalt fuer Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin); in Spain by Morgan Stanley, S.V., S.A., a Morgan Stanley group company, which is supervised by the Spanish Securities Markets Commission (CNMV) and states that Morgan Stanley Research has been written and distributed in accordance with the rules of conduct applicable to financial research as established under Spanish regulations; in the United States by Morgan Stanley & Co. Incorporated, which accepts responsibility for its contents. Morgan Stanley & Co. International plc, authorized and regulated by the Financial Services Authority, disseminates in the UK research that it has prepared, and approves solely for the purposes of section 21 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000, research which has been prepared by any of its affiliates. Morgan Stanley Private Wealth Management Limited, authorized and regulated by the Financial Services Authority, also disseminates Morgan Stanley Research in the UK. Private U.K. investors should obtain the advice of their Morgan Stanley & Co. International plc or Morgan Stanley Private Wealth Management representative about the investments concerned. RMB Morgan Stanley (Proprietary) Limited is a member of the JSE Limited and regulated by the Financial Services Board in South Africa. RMB Morgan Stanley

January 7, 2011  
European Banks  
EC – More Clarity on Resolution

(Proprietary) Limited is a joint venture owned equally by Morgan Stanley International Holdings Inc. and RMB Investment Advisory (Proprietary) Limited, which is wholly owned by FirstRand Limited.

The information in Morgan Stanley Research is being communicated by Morgan Stanley & Co. International plc (DIFC Branch), regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (the DFSA), and is directed at Professional Clients only, as defined by the DFSA. The financial products or financial services to which this research relates will only be made available to a customer who we are satisfied meets the regulatory criteria to be a Professional Client.

The information in Morgan Stanley Research is being communicated by Morgan Stanley & Co. International plc (QFC Branch), regulated by the Qatar Financial Centre Regulatory Authority (the QFCRA), and is directed at business customers and market counterparties only and is not intended for Retail Customers as defined by the QFCRA.

As required by the Capital Markets Board of Turkey, investment information, comments and recommendations stated here, are not within the scope of investment advisory activity. Investment advisory service is provided in accordance with a contract of engagement on investment advisory concluded between brokerage houses, portfolio management companies, non-deposit banks and clients. Comments and recommendations stated here rely on the individual opinions of the ones providing these comments and recommendations. These opinions may not fit to your financial status, risk and return preferences. For this reason, to make an investment decision by relying solely to this information stated here may not bring about outcomes that fit your expectations.

The trademarks and service marks contained in Morgan Stanley Research are the property of their respective owners. Third-party data providers make no warranties or representations of any kind relating to the accuracy, completeness, or timeliness of the data they provide and shall not have liability for any damages of any kind relating to such data. The Global Industry Classification Standard ("GICS") was developed by and is the exclusive property of MSCI and S&P.

Morgan Stanley Research, or any portion thereof may not be reprinted, sold or redistributed without the written consent of Morgan Stanley.

Morgan Stanley Research is disseminated and available primarily electronically, and, in some cases, in printed form.

**Additional information on recommended securities/instruments is available on request.**

wn010711

**The Americas**

1585 Broadway  
New York, NY 10036-8293  
United States  
Tel: +1 (1)212 761 4000

**Europe**

20 Bank Street, Canary Wharf  
London E14 4AD  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 (0) 20 7 425 8000

**Japan**

4-20-3 Ebisu, Shibuya-ku  
Tokyo 150-6008  
Japan  
Tel: +81 (0)3 5424 5000

**Asia/Pacific**

1 Austin Road West  
Kowloon  
Hong Kong  
Tel: +852 2848 5200